Index funds have democratized access to diversified investment for millions of savers around the world who are investing for long term goals, such as retirement. However, the popularity of index funds has drawn critics who claim that index funds and exchange-traded funds (ETFs) may affect markets. Skeptics of index investing have questioned whether the proliferation of index funds may increase the correlation between asset returns, or cause stock prices to move in lockstep. Another common hypothesis is that the buying and selling of index funds may blunt the price signals of underlying securities, or diminish the value of information that could be derived from the prices of securities included in an index. Each of these concerns is not supported by the data on asset correlations or price discovery.

Drivers of correlation in asset prices

Correlations in asset class returns are driven primarily by factors related to the macroeconomic environment. Common factors that investors point to as drivers of asset correlations are global interest rate policies, changes in aggregate demand for assets, and the prices of raw materials.

While many people have suggested that index funds might be drivers of increased cross-stock correlations, this claim is not supported by the data. As shown in Exhibit 1, cross-stock correlations were higher in the 1930s – before the advent of index investing – than they are today. Exhibit 1 also shows a decrease in stock return correlations between 2015 and 2017, a period when index funds were achieving record growth.

Exhibit 1: Average Stock Return Correlations from 1929-2017
12-month trailing moving averages


Price signals and index investing

Another hypothesis is that the rise of index investing might be driving security prices away from their fundamental, or intrinsic, values. The premise of this hypothesis is that index funds might be detracting from the information that security fundamentals (like cash flows and price-to-earnings ratios) provide to the market, because the buy and sell decisions of index funds are based on benchmark index weights and not on fundamentals.
In reality, index funds add information to the market. As the number of investors utilizing index funds to express their views grows, flows into and out of these products may be good indicators of investor sentiment. For example, flows into less risky products may provide insight into how investors feel about the strength of the market. This information can be useful for portfolio construction and risk assessment.

Many investors buying emerging market equities and selling developed market equities, for example, should translate into changed valuations for these sectors, regardless of how investors are gaining this exposure. In the absence of index funds, investors could express these views through other market access vehicles – like mutual funds, single stocks and derivatives – and the change in valuation should still occur. Index funds simply offer a convenient wrapper for investors to express their views in a cost-effective and efficient manner.

This hypothesis is made more unlikely by the fact that the impact of ETF flows on the underlying stock market is still very small. In 2018, global ETFs amassed $515 billion in inflows. Despite these record inflows, the impact on underlying stock trading volume was small, totaling approximately 5% of average daily trading volumes, as shown in Exhibit 2.

**Exhibit 2: Monthly ETF Imputed Flows**

![Graph showing monthly ETF imputed flows](image)

Price Discovery: Role of ETFs

Contrary to the rhetoric, index investing, particularly through ETFs, actually contributes to price discovery. The trading of ETFs on stock exchanges is an important contributor to price discovery across markets, sectors and individual stocks. International ETFs traded during US market hours contribute to price discovery every day when local markets are closed. For example, during suspensions of international stocks or markets, US-domiciled ETFs may be the primary source of pricing information available to market participants.

Additionally, ETFs have been tested in numerous stressed markets and have exhibited generally tight bid-ask spreads, heavy volumes and high liquidity under volatile market conditions. During times of market uncertainty, ETFs have acted as ‘shock absorbers’, allowing market participants to transact in the secondary market at real-time prices.

**Bottom line:**

There is no evidence to suggest that index investing increases asset correlations or blunts stock price signals. Index investing, and particularly ETFs, support price discovery and have demonstrated their role as ‘shock absorbers’ during market stress events.

---

**Notes**

This publication represents the regulatory and public policy views of BlackRock. The opinions expressed herein are as of April 2019 and are subject to change at any time due to changes in the market, the economic or regulatory environment or for other reasons. The information in this presentation should not be construed as research or relied upon in making investment decisions with respect to a specific company or security or be used as legal advice. Any reference to a specific company or security is for illustrative purposes and does not constitute a recommendation to buy, sell, hold or directly invest in the company or its securities, or an offer or invitation to anyone to invest in any BlackRock funds and has not been prepared in connection with any such offer. There is no guarantee that any forecasts made will come to pass. Reliance upon information in this material is at the sole discretion of the reader.

In the U.S., this material is intended for public distribution. In the EU, issued by BlackRock Investment Management (UK) Limited (authorised and regulated by the Financial Conduct Authority). Registered office: 12 Throgmorton Avenue, London, EC2N 2DL. Registered in England No. 2020394. Tel: 020 7743 3000. For your protection, telephone calls are usually recorded. BlackRock is a trading name of BlackRock Investment Management (UK) Limited. This material is for distribution to Professional Clients (as defined by the FCA Rules) and Qualified Investors and should not be relied upon by any other persons. For qualified investors in Switzerland, this material shall be exclusively made available to, and directed at, qualified investors as defined in the Swiss Collective Investment Schemes Act of 23 June 2006, as amended. Issued in the Netherlands by the Amsterdam branch office of BlackRock Investment Management (UK) Limited: Amstelplein 1, 1096 HA Amsterdam. Tel: 020 - 549 5200. In South Africa, please be advised that BlackRock Investment Management (UK) Limited is an authorised Financial Services provider with the South African Financial Services Board, FSP No. 43288. In Dubai: This information can be distributed in and from the Dubai International Financial Centre (DIFC) by BlackRock Advisors (UK) Limited — Dubai Branch which is regulated by the Dubai Financial Services Authority (DFSA) and is only directed at ‘Professional Clients’ and no other person should rely upon the information contained within it. Neither the DFSA or any other authority or regulator located in the GCC or MENA region has approved this information. This information and associated materials have been provided to you at your express request, and for your exclusive use. This document is not intended for distribution to, or use by, any person or entity in any jurisdiction or country where such distribution would be unlawful under the securities laws of such. Any distribution, by whatever means, of this document and related material to persons other than those referred to above is strictly prohibited. In Singapore, this is issued by BlackRock (Singapore) Limited (Co. registration no. 200010143N). In Hong Kong, this material is issued by BlackRock Asset Management North Asia Limited and has not been reviewed by the Securities and Futures Commission of Hong Kong. In Korea, this material is for Professional Investors only. In Japan, this is issued by BlackRock Japan Co., Ltd. (Financial Instruments Business Operator: The Kanto Regional Financial Bureau. License No375, Association Memberships: Japan Investment Advisers Association, the Investment Trusts Association, Japan, Japan Securities Dealers Association, Type II Financial Instruments Firms Association,) for Professional Investors only (Professional Investor is defined in Financial Instruments and Exchange Act). In Taiwan, independently operated by BlackRock Investment Management (Taiwan) Limited. Address: 26F, No. 95, Tun Hwa South Road, Section 2, Taipei 106, Taiwan. Tel: (02)23261600.

In Australia, issued by BlackRock Investment Management (Australia) Limited ABN 13 006 165 975, AFSL 230 523 (BIMAL). This material is not a securities recommendation or an offer or solicitation with respect to the purchase or sale of any securities in any jurisdiction. The material provides general information only and does not take into account your individual objectives, financial situation, needs or circumstances. Before making any investment decision, you should therefore assess whether the material is appropriate for you and obtain financial advice tailored to you having regard to your individual objectives, financial situation, needs and circumstances. BIMAL, its officers, employees and agents believe that the information in this material and the sources on which it is based may (which may be sourced from third parties) are correct as at the date of publication. While every care has been taken in the preparation of this material, no warranty of accuracy or reliability is given and no responsibility for the information is accepted by BIMAL, its officers, employees or agents. Any investment is subject to investment risk, including the loss of income or the principal invested. While any forecasts, estimates and opinions in this material are made on a reasonable basis, actual future results and operations may differ materially from the forecasts, estimates and opinions set out in this material. No guarantee as to the repayment of capital or the performance of any product or rate of return referred to in this material is made by BIMAL or any entity in the BlackRock group of companies. In China, this material may not be distributed to individuals resident in the People's Republic of China ("PRC", for such purposes, excluding Hong Kong, Macau and Taiwan) or entities registered in the PRC unless such parties have received all the required PRC government approvals to participate in any investment or receive any investment advisory or investment management services. For other APAC countries, this material is issued for Institutional Investors only (or professional/sophisticated/qualified investors, as such term may apply in local jurisdictions) and does not constitute investment advice or an offer or solicitation to purchase or sell in any securities, BlackRock funds or any investment strategy nor shall any securities be offered or sold to any person in any jurisdiction in which an offer, solicitation, purchase or sale would be unlawful under the securities laws of such jurisdiction. In Canada, this material is intended for permitted clients only. In Latin America and Iberia, this material is for educational purposes only and does not constitute investment advice nor an offer or solicitation to sell or a solicitation of an offer to buy any shares of any fund (nor shall any such shares be offered or sold to any person) in any jurisdiction in which an offer, solicitation, purchase or sale would be unlawful under the securities law of that jurisdiction. If any funds are mentioned or referred to in this material, it is possible that some or all of the funds have not been registered with the securities regulator of Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Mexico, Panama, Peru, Portugal, Spain, Uruguay or any other securities regulator in any Latin American country and might not be publicly offered within any such country. The securities regulators of such countries have not confirmed the accuracy of any information contained herein. The information provided here is neither tax nor legal advice.

©2019 BlackRock, Inc. All Rights Reserved. BLACKROCK is a registered trademark of BlackRock, Inc. All other trademarks are those of their respective owners.